

PROCEEDINGS.

SEMI-ANNUAL MEETING, APRIL 24, 1895, AT THE HALL OF THE
AMERICAN ACADEMY OF ARTS AND SCIENCES, BOSTON.

THE Society was called to order at 10.30 A. M., by the President, Hon. STEPHEN SALISBURY. In the temporary absence of the RECORDING SECRETARY, Mr. NATHANIEL PAINE was elected Secretary *pro tem*.

The following members were present¹:—

Edward E. Hale, George F. Hoar, Nathaniel Paine, Stephen Salisbury, Samuel A. Green, Elijah B. Stoddard, George S. Paine, Edward L. Davis, James F. Hunnewell, Egbert C. Smyth, Albert H. Hoyt, Edward G. Porter, Reuben A. Guild, Charles C. Smith, Edmund M. Barton, Lucius R. Paige, Franklin B. Dexter, Charles A. Chase, Samuel S. Green, Justin Winsor, Frederic W. Putnam, Solomon Lincoln, Andrew McF. Davis, J. Evarts Greene, Henry S. Nourse, Reuben Colton, Robert N. Toppan, Henry H. Edes, James P. Baxter, G. Stanley Hall, John McK. Merriam, William E. Foster, J Franklin Jameson, Edwin D. Mead, Calvin Stebbins, Francis H. Dewey, Charles J. Hoadly, Benjamin A. Gould, Reuben G. Thwaites, Edward L. Pierce, Henry A. Marsh, Edward F. Johnson, William DeL. Love, Jr., Rockwood Hoar, James L. Whitney.

THE PRESIDENT: "I notice the presence here of our oldest member, Dr. LUCIUS R. PAIGE, who has just entered upon the ninety-fourth year of his age. His attendance at this stated meeting is an honor to the Society and he has our congratulations. Those in favor of having a notice of

¹ The names of members follow the order of their election.

his attendance spread upon the records will manifest it by rising." The rising vote was unanimous.

The PRESIDENT: "Some of our members have noticed what seemed to them to be an unnecessary labor and reiteration in the fact that the Treasurer's statement is made public twice in the same year. It entails some work on the Treasurer, which seems to be unnecessary, and the report occupies more space in the bound volume than is required. Hence the Council have thought that a modification of the by-laws would be wise."

Secretary CHASE: "In accordance with Article IX. of the by-laws, which reads that 'No new law or alteration of any of these by-laws shall be made unless recommended by the Council and adopted by the Society at a stated meeting,' the Council recommends to the Society an amendment to Article IV., in reference to the duties of the Treasurer. Instead of the words 'shall present a copy thereof to the Council at their meeting next preceding any stated meeting of the Society,' the Council recommends that it read 'next preceding the annual meeting of the Society'; that is, a substitution of the word 'annual' for 'any stated.'"

On motion, this amendment was unanimously adopted.

The report of the Council was then presented by Mr. SAMUEL SWETT GREEN.

The TREASURER made a brief statement of the finances of the Society.

The report of the Librarian was presented by Mr. EDMUND M. BARTON.

The PRESIDENT announced that the entire report of the Council was open for remarks.

Dr. G. STANLEY HALL: "I will make one remark in connection with the interesting and valuable paper on the Scotch-Irish in this country. Those of us whose vocation it is to be more or less familiar with anthropological literature of recent date, know how much stress is laid upon

crossing of bloods. The literature in that line has made certain laws pretty plain and definite. I do not know where there is a better illustration of the beneficial effects of crossing different stocks than this. There was probably not a great deal of intermarriage and the Scotch and Irish blood was not much mixed. The Irish race anthropologically regarded is, as a stock, remarkable for its vitality, for its *esprit*, for its ready wit, for its quick susceptibility to all relations with all things and all men around it. On the other hand, the Scotch mature later, and from the standpoint of brain analysis they must be as remarkable for the fibres that connect the parts of the cortex one with the other, the so called 'association fibres,' as the Irish brain must be for 'projective fibres' connecting with the external world. How thoroughly proved that is I would not like to say. I do not think the measurements have yet decided, and the final verdict is not in. Such measurements must cover a very large area, and must include a *consensus* from a very large number of single cases. But it is a matter of great interest, and that there is something in it, even the most conservative may, I think, admit.

"Now of those races that have come together in this way, one of the best combinations in history is this of the Scotch and Irish. Anthropology teaches us that many of the combinations of the bloods of different ancestral racial stock have not been happy; that many of the effects of crossing have been injurious; that they have produced instability, early death; and that the fertility of the stock has been affected unfavorably. History shows that in the great majority of cases the intermingling of blood has been unhappy. So it seems to me worthy of going on record that here we have what very safe writers may designate as one of the best combinations. The combination of racial bloods is not a mere matter of biology or physiology, but it involves the very highest mental qualities. It is not a physical matter alone, because physical inheritance does not include mere

physical mingling of the bloods, but it includes that subtle atmosphere of associations, of home traditions, of family recollections and ideals and aims, that are so inseparable. Therefore it includes all the environment of childhood and early youth. The favorable comingling of bloods is seen in the Scotch-Irish race; and they are not only more susceptible to all environments outside, but their activity is prolonged to a greater period of age. They maintain their vigor and longevity. My old friend and colleague, Dr. McCosh, is one of the best illustrations of the influence of psychological comingling. He came well on in middle life to a new country with new ideas, and he came into a department in process of rapid and radical transformation. He came full of the traditions of the old Scotch philosophy ingrained in his very blood, a philosophy which has been the most conservative and most unprogressive, and he not only adapted himself with remarkable facility to the new environment of a new country but to the new philosophical situation. There was not a man in the country that was so ready to welcome and receive all those newer ideas that came from biological and anthropological sources as Dr. McCosh. It gave him another register to his mind, and I cannot help thinking that that is a significant and unusual result which is to be of great value in the future history of the races. Now that we are coming to understand these laws; now that we are coming to see that they come out more in the soul than they do in the body; that they seem to have their chief field of display in a later development of the higher regions of intellect and feeling and emotion and enthusiasm,—I must think that these views are to have a practical effect upon the very most practical of all matters which young men and young women are called upon to consider, and which bear upon the foundation and perpetuity of families and of races.”

HON. EDWARD L. PIERCE: “I have been much instructed by the paper which has been read this morning on the

Scotch or Scotch-Irish in America. It recalls a brief record which recently came under my eye in reading the unpublished journal of John Rowe, a Boston merchant, for the period 1764-1779. His entry for May 11, 1774, is 'Capt. Lyde in Wm. Dennie's ship arrived, and a vessell from Scotland with upwards of a hundred passengers.' Neither the journal nor the newspapers of the time state where these passengers went. It is the only record of the arrival of emigrants which Rowe makes. It may be noted incidentally that the Scotch have affected the life and history of Massachusetts less than those of several other States.

"The Scotch has seemed to me to be the strongest race in the world, and I may mention one or two points concerning them which have impressed me. It is striking to observe how largely they are the superintendents of factories. I have myself seen them holding such positions at places remote from each other,—in New Hampshire, Rhode Island and even in Mexico. Their function is to direct the actual running of the mill and to see that the laborers work faithfully and effectively.

"I was in Columbia, South Carolina, a few years ago on the evening before the Farmers' convention which accomplished a political revolution in that State. I was struck with the healthy and robust bodies of the delegates, many of whom were of Scotch or Scotch-Irish descent, a race which still largely holds the plantations of the Carolinas. They seemed intelligent and vigorous, mentally as well as physically. I can answer too for their excellent powers of digestion; for they consumed food altogether beyond the capacity of most of us. The way in which this race has held its own in that State testifies to its permanency and durability.

"The religion which has prevailed in Scotland seems to have fitted the race. One cannot quite understand how the French were so responsive to Calvinism, but we cannot be surprised that the Scotch were. The tough fibre of the

Scotch character and the tough fibre of Genevan theology were woven readily together.

“The Scotch Church polity and doctrine have, however, not kept their hold in Massachusetts. By some process of evolution, in a case argued before Chief Justice Shaw, with Choate and Dana on one side and Bartlett and Hillard on the other, where I remember to have heard Choate’s plea, it was held that it was no perversion of a religious trust for an estate on Long Lane, afterwards Federal Street, given in 1735 to be held according to the tenures of the Church of Scotland, to be afterwards used for the maintenance of the Unitarian Church now standing at the corner of Arlington and Boylston streets.”¹

Senator GEORGE F. HOAR: “I think this paper is one of the best papers we have had for a great many years, and one of the most suggestive. I was delighted with what was said by the two gentlemen who have spoken, but in regard to President Hall’s interesting remarks I should like to be instructed a little by the author of the paper as to whether there was any intermarriage between the Scotch who went to Ireland and whose children came here, and the Irish. Were they generally the men who went over with Edward Bruce, or of the men who went over in Cromwell’s time? I had supposed, from imperfect knowledge, that nearly all the Scotch-Irish who came to this country before the Revolution only staid in Ireland for a generation or two, and that there was a very bitter division between them and the Catholic Irish whom they found there, so that there was no intermixture by marriage of any consequence. The names are almost invariably Scotch names, not Irish names, although Celtic names are common to both. I should like to have Mr. GREEN tell us whether in fact we get any illustration of President HALL’s laws from the transient abode of the

¹ Attorney-General *vs.* Proprietors of the Meeting-house in Federal street in the Town of Boston. 3 Gray’s Reports, p. 1.

Scotchmen in Ireland, unless it is contained in that part of his paper which he did not read."

Mr. SAMUEL S. GREEN: "I did speak of that in the part of the paper which I omitted in reading. The Scotch had long been wandering over Europe, but it was about the beginning of the seventeenth century that large colonies from the lowlands began to cross to Ireland. The great plantation in Ulster began in 1610. The immigrant Scots mingled very little with the Irish. They were careful to keep apart. They did mingle with the Huguenots and with the English Puritans. But they became enlarged in their ways of thinking by living in Ireland. I think that a superiority of the Scotch-Irish over the Scotch was acquired by their presence among the Irish. And it would be easy to believe that they acquired additional good qualities by coming to America."

Dr. REUBEN A. GUILD: "Mr. GREEN's excellent paper on our Scotch-Irish immigrants, and his statement that they have always been on the side of popular education and religious liberty, reminds me that the first funds for the endowment of Rhode Island College, now Brown University, were procured from among the Protestant Churches of Ireland. The first movement for the founding of the College is attributed to the Rev. Morgan Edwards, of Philadelphia, a distinguished Welsh clergyman, who came to this country in the year 1760. He had been pastor for seven years of a Baptist Church in Cork, where he married his wife. In 1767 he was appointed to solicit funds for the 'Infant College' in England and Ireland. Naturally he went first to Cork, the place of his early labors, and then to Waterford and Dublin. The bulk of his subscriptions in Ireland were obtained in the northern parts,—in Belfast, Lisburn, Antrim, Coleraine, Londonderry and Newry. The sum which Mr. Edwards eventually obtained was nearly a thousand pounds sterling, a large sum of money for those early days. The original subscription book with

genuine signatures is preserved in the archives of the College library."

Dr. EDWARD E. HALE: "I think Mr. GREEN is the proper person to pay compliments to the Puritan and to the Scotch-Irish. I do not know whether they claim Columbus as a Scotch-Irishman or not, but they claim pretty much everybody and everything. Among other things, we have always rather boasted here that we have the best and earliest illustration of the social compact down in Provincetown, but these gentlemen have proved that we have nothing to do with it, because we were subjects of King James, and said we were. When they organized the State of Tennessee, they did not say they were anybody's subjects, except the good God's, and they therefore claim that theirs is the earliest social compact in the world. I hope that sometime Mr. GREEN will have the kindness to read us a paper on the earliest social compact."

Professor J. FRANKLIN JAMESON: "I have no criticism to make upon anything Mr. GREEN said, but I should like to make a comment on the quotation from the work of Mr. Douglas Campbell, which may throw some light on the matter of the subsequent discussion. Mr. Campbell says, speaking of the Presidents of the United States, that there were so many Irish, so many Scotch, one Welsh, etc. He speaks of Monroe as Scotch and Jefferson as Welsh. It seems to me that Mr. Campbell has fallen into a not uncommon fallacy in speaking of those races not English which have had a good deal to do in forming the United States. Take Monroe. The name is Scotch and it is likely, though I think it has never been proved, that the President's first ancestor in this country of the name of Monroe was a Scotchman. But this does not make James Monroe a Scot. It may be proved that the first Jefferson ancestor in America of Mr. Jefferson was a Welshman, but that would make his blood Welsh to the extent of but one part in sixteen or in thirty-two, and we know that a considerable

portion of the other sixteenths and thirty-seconds was English. Even if it be proved that the Scotch did not mingle with the Irish, and that the Scotch blood was kept pure in the north of Ireland, nevertheless the law mentioned by President Hall would apply to the intermixture of Scotch and Irish in America. Those who bear the Scotch-Irish names like to be thought to descend from the Scotch rather than from the Irish, but I doubt whether it is so true as is commonly supposed. I have been interested in one little indication derived from Pennsylvania. Charles Biddle, vice-president of the Supreme Council of Pennsylvania, says in his autobiography, speaking of the activity of the Irish in Pennsylvania politics, that in the western part of the State (the region we call Scotch-Irish) the politicians were almost altogether Irish, so completely so that if a man was not an Irishman and wished to engage in politics he came to speak with an Irish brogue, either unconsciously or as a means of ingratiating. Now the instances that he quoted are Irish in dialect and not Scotch."

Senator GEORGE F. HOAR: "Is there any trace among the Scotch-Irish of our Revolutionary time of a single Scotch-Irish Roman Catholic? If they went to Ireland and married Catholic women, the woman would prevail in the religious quality of the family."

Professor JAMESON: "It seems to me strange that they should have been there two or three generations without something of a mixture, yet you do not find them Catholic. But you do find among them O'Neills, of Celtic name."

On motion, it was voted to adopt the Report of the Council and refer it to the Committee of Publication.

The RECORDING SECRETARY read the names of the following gentlemen, proposed for membership by the Council:—

THOMAS CORWIN MENDENHALL, of Worcester.

LEWIS HENRY BOUTELL, of Evanston, Ill..

FRANCIS CABOT LOWELL, of Boston.

CLARENCE BLOOMFIELD MOORE, of Philadelphia, Pa.

Separate ballots being taken, all were duly elected.

A paper was then read by Mr. REUBEN G. THWAITES on "The Story of Chequamegon Bay."

Certain notes on the theological work of the late Rev. Dr. George E. Ellis were then presented by Rev. Dr. EDWARD E. HALE.

The PRESIDENT: "I desire to say in regard to the loss to the Society of Dr. Ellis, that not only in his life by his attendance and interest in the purposes of the Society did he show his interest, but I find in his testament a notice regarding us and a benefaction in the shape of a donation which informally I would like to bring to the attention of the Society—not to take action, for that will come later. For the information of the Society, I would like to read a paragraph in his will dated October 15, 1887, in which he refers to the Society in the following terms:—

"8. I give and bequeath in trust to the American Antiquarian Society, of which for many years I have been a grateful member, the sum of ten thousand dollars, to constitute a fund the annual income only of which shall be used for any object of the Society and approved by it on the recommendation of the Council of said Society."

"Most of the members present whose term of service in the Society has dated back a decade and longer, will remember the constant attendance of our associate, Dr. Ellis, his frequent contributions, and his suggestions, which are better known to the officers perhaps than to the members of the Society. Better than his bequest to the Society was the fostering care which he ever manifested in the past. I think an appreciation of the notice and of this statement might well be recognized by the Society rising." The members of the Society all rose.

A paper was read by Mr. ANDREW MCF. DAVIS on "The Law of Adultery and Ignominious Punishments."

A paper on "The Food of Certain American Indians and their Methods of Preparing it," by Mr. LUCIEN CARR, was read, in his absence, by Mr. ROCKWOOD HOAR.

A communication from Mr. EDWARD H. THOMPSON, on Palenque, was read by the PRESIDENT.

A circular with reference to the Peary Expedition to Baffin's Bay was presented by Dr. HALE, who said: "This seems to offer the only hope that there is of getting in touch with the original Norse settlement of Greenland. Dr. Cook found two years ago at the head of a fjord remains of Norse occupation, and those remains are still unexplored. On an island at the mouth, he found wheat growing, which can hardly be accounted for except by introduction from the Greenland settlement. There is one stone-age village left not contaminated yet by hoop-iron. I am glad to see that you feel like going to explore it."

A vote of thanks was passed to the persons who had read papers and who had spoken, and the papers and remarks were referred to the Committee of Publication.

At 1.45 the Society adjourned to a collation at the Parker House, to which they were invited by Dr. SAMUEL A. GREEN in the name of the members living in Boston and its neighborhood.

CHARLES A. CHASE,

Recording Secretary.

Copyright of Proceedings of the American Antiquarian Society is the property of American Antiquarian Society and its content may not be copied or emailed to multiple sites or posted to a listserv without the copyright holder's express written permission. However, users may print, download, or email articles for individual use.